Chapter Title Page


## 1 Introduction 1-1

1.1 Background ... 1-1
1.1.1 Project Study Area ... 1-1
1.1.2 Purpose and Need ... 1-2
1.1.3 Notice of Intent and Alternatives Analysis ... 1-2
1.1.4 Revised Notice of Intent ... 1-4
1.1.5 Tiered Analysis Approach ... 1-4
1.1.6 Level 3 Screening ... 1-4
1.1.7 Mode Alternatives/Options Under Study ... 1-4
1.2 Public Involvement Process ... 1-6
1.2.1 Briefings and Meetings ... 1-6
1.2.2 Project Web Site ... 1-7
1.2.3 Community Outreach Centers ... 1-7
1.2.4 Stakeholder Advisory Working Groups ... 1-7
1.2.5 Scoping Meetings ... 1-7
1.3 Existing Travel Patterns ... 1-8
1.3.1 Journey-to-Work Patterns of Rockland County Residents ... 1-8
1.3.2 Journey-to-Work Patterns of Westchester County Residents ... 1-10
1.3.3 Journey-to-Work Patterns of Orange County Residents ... 1-13
1.3.4 Key Corridor Markets ... 1-14

## 2 Bus Rapid Transit in the Corridor 2-1

2.1 Description of BRT Systems ... 2-1
2.1.1 Types of Transitway ... 2-2
2.1.2 Key Vehicle Concepts ... 2-3
2.1.3 Key Station Concepts ... 2-4
2.1.4 Intelligent Transportation System (ITS) Components ... 2-5
2.1.5 US Cities with BRT or BRT Projects ... 2-6
2.2 Application of BRT Technology to the TZB/I-287 Corridor ... 2-8
2.3 Description of BRT Alternatives/Options ... 2-9
2.3.1 Alternative 3 – Full-Corridor BRT ... 2-9
2.3.2 Description of Option 3A ... 2-14
2.3.3 Description of Option 3B ... 2-14

## 3 Light Rail Transit in the Corridor 3-1

3.1 Description of LRT Systems ... 3-1
3.1.1 Types of Guideway ... 3-2
3.1.2 Key Vehicle Concepts ... 3-3
3.1.3 Key Station Concepts ... 3-4
3.1.4 ITS Components ... 3-4
3.2 Application of LRT Technology to the Tappan Zee Bridge/I-287 Corridor ... 3-4
3.3 Description of the LRT Alternatives/Options ... 3-5
3.3.1 Full-Corridor LRT ... 3-5
3.3.2 Option 4B – LRT in Westchester ... 3-11

## 4 Commuter Rail Transit in the Corridor 4-1

4.1 Description of CRT Systems ... 4-2
4.1.1 Types of Guideway, Grades, and Geometry ... 4-3
4.1.2 Key Vehicle Concepts ... 4-4
4.1.3 Key Station Concepts ... 4-5
4.1.4 ITS Components ... 4-6
4.2 Application of CRT Technology to the Tappan Zee Bridge/I-287 Corridor ... 4-6
4.2.1 Technology ... 4-6
4.2.2 System Connectivity ... 4-6
4.3 Description of CRT Alternatives/Options ... 4-6
4.3.1 Alternative 4A ... 4-6
4.3.2 Option 4A-X ... 4-10
4.3.3 Alternative 4B ... 4-11
4.3.4 Alternative 4C ... 4-11
4.3.5 Option 4D ... 4-11

## 5 Transportation Evaluation 5-1

5.1 Transportation Demand Modeling ... 5-1
5.1.1 BPM Structure ... 5-1
5.1.2 No Build ... 5-3
5.1.3 Coding of Alternatives/Options ... 5-3
5.2 Transit Ridership ... 5-5
5.2.1 Criterion ... 5-5
5.2.2 Comparison of Transit Modes ... 5-6
5.3 Transit Travel Time ... 5-10
5.3.1 Description of Criterion ... 5-10
5.3.2 Comparison of Transit Modes ... 5-11
5.4 Capacity ... 5-15
5.4.1 Description of Criteria ... 5-15
5.4.2 Comparison of Transit Modes ... 5-16
5.5 Roadway Congestion ... 5-16
5.5.1 Description of Criteria ... 5-16
5.5.2 Comparison of Transit Modes ... 5-16
5.6 Summary ... 5-17

Chapter Title Page

## 6 Environmental Evaluation 6-1

6.1 Consistency with Land Use Plans ... 6-1
6.1.1 Description of Criterion ... 6-1
6.1.2 Comparison of Transit Modes ... 6-1
6.2 Residential and Commercial Acquisitions/Displacements ... 6-1
6.2.1 Description of Criterion ... 6-1
6.2.2 Comparison of Transit Modes ... 6-1
6.3 Transit-Oriented Development (TOD) Potential ... 6-2
6.3.1 Description of Criterion ... 6-2
6.3.2 Comparison of Transit Modes ... 6-2
6.4 Wetlands ... 6-2
6.4.1 Description of Criterion ... 6-3
6.4.2 Comparison of Transit Modes ... 6-3
6.5 Parklands ... 6-3
6.5.1 Description of Criterion ... 6-3
6.5.2 Comparison of Transit Modes ... 6-3
6.6 Historic and Archaeological Resources ... 6-4
6.6.1 Description of Criterion ... 6-4
6.6.2 Comparison of Transit Modes ... 6-5
6.7 Hudson River Habitat Disturbance ... 6-6
6.7.1 Description of Criterion ... 6-6
6.7.2 Comparison of Transit Modes ... 6-7
6.8 Air Quality ... 6-7
6.8.1 Description of Criterion ... 6-7
6.8.2 Comparison of Transit Modes ... 6-7
6.9 Energy/Greenhouse Gases ... 6-8
6.9.1 Description of Criterion ... 6-8
6.9.2 Comparison of Transit Modes ... 6-8
6.10 Summary of Environmental Evaluation ... 6-9

## 7 Cost Evaluation 7-1

7.1 Capital Cost ... 7-1
7.1.1 Description of Criterion ... 7-1
7.1.2 Comparison of Transit Modes ... 7-2
7.2 Annual Operating Costs ... 7-4
7.2.1 Description of Criterion ... 7-4
7.2.2 Comparison of Transit Modes ... 7-4
7.3 Fare Revenue ... 7-5
7.3.1 Description of Criterion ... 7-5
7.3.2 Comparison of Transit Modes ... 7-5
7.4 Cost/Net Cost Per Passenger and Passenger-Mile ... 7-5
7.4.1 Description of Criteria ... 7-5
7.4.2 Comparison of Transit Modes ... 7-6
7.5 Travel Time Benefits ... 7-6
7.5.1 Description of Criterion ... 7-6
7.5.2 Comparison of Transit Modes ... 7-7
7.6 Summary of Cost Evaluation ... 7-7

## 8 Transit Mode Evaluation and Recommendation 8-1

8.1 Planning Context ... 8-1
8.2 Transportation Criteria ... 8-2
8.2.1 Ridership on New Transit Services ... 8-2
8.2.2 Travel Time Benefits ... 8-2
8.3 Environmental Criteria ... 8-3
8.4 Cost Criteria ... 8-3
8.4.1 Capital Costs ... 8-3
8.4.2 Operating Costs and Fare Revenues ... 8-4
8.4.3 Cost per Passenger and Passenger-Mile ... 8-4
8.5 Recommendation ... 8-5
8.6 Transit Components to be Studied in the DEIS. ... 8-6

## 9 References 9-1

## Appendix A BPM Model Inputs A-1

## List of Figures


| Chapter | Title | Page |
|---|---|---|
| 1-1 | Tappan Zee Bridge/I-287 Corridor | 1-1 |
| 1-2 | Corridor-Wide Scenarios | 1-3 |
| 1-3 | Alternatives/Options | 1-5 |
| 1-4 | Work Destinations of Rockland Residents | 1-8 |
| 1-5 | Major Intra-Rockland Work Journeys Crossing the I-287 Corridor | 1-9 |
| 1-6 | Work Destinations of Westchester Residents | 1-11 |
| 1-7 | Major Intra-Westchester Work Journeys within the I-287 Corridor | 1-12 |
| 1-8 | Residential Origins of White Plains Workers | 1-12 |
| 1-9 | Work Destinations of Orange Residents | 1-14 |
| 2-1 | BRT Range of Options | 2-1 |
| 2-2 | BRT Service Concept | 2-2 |
| 2-3 | BRT Propulsion Systems | 2-4 |
| 2-4 | US BRT Systems | 2-6 |
| 2-5 | East Bay BRT Berkeley to San Leandro Route | 2-6 |
| 2-6 | East Bay BRT Cross Section | 2-6 |
| 2-7 | Pittsburgh West Busway | 2-6 |
| 2-8 | Pittsburgh M.L. King East Busway | 2-7 |
| 2-9 | Pittsburgh South Busway | 2-7 |
| 2-10 | Dual Hub (Euclid) Corridor BRT Route | 2-7 |
| 2-11 | Houston Busway/HOV Network | 2-8 |
| 2-12 | Houston Remote Park and Ride Lots | 2-8 |
| 2-13 | Alternative 3 – Full-Corridor Bus Rapid Transit in Rockland County | 2-10 |
| 2-14 | Alternative 3 – Full-Corridor Bus Rapid Transit in Westchester County | 2-11 |
| 2-15 | Key Destinations and Walk Distances in White Plains | 2-13 |
| 2-16 | BRT White Plains Alignment Option 1 | 2-13 |
| 2-17 | BRT White Plains Alignment Option 3 | 2-13 |
| 2-18 | Option 3A – Full-Corridor Bus Rapid Transit in Rockland County | 2-16 |
| 2-19 | Option 3A – Full-Corridor Bus Rapid Transit in Westchester County | 2-17 |
| 2-20 | Alternative 3B – Full-Corridor Bus Rapid Transit in Rockland County | 2-18 |
| 2-21 | Alternative 3B – Full-Corridor Bus Rapid Transit in Westchester County | 2-19 |
| 3-1 | Range of Options Available for LRT | 3-1 |
| 3-2 | Typical LRT In-Street Configurations | 3-2 |
| 3-3 | Full-Corridor Light Rail Transit in Rockland County | 3-6 |
| 3-4 | Full-Corridor Light Rail Transit in Westchester County | 3-7 |
| 3-5 | LRT White Plains Alignment Option 2 | 3-10 |
| 3-6 | LRT White Plains Alignment Option 4 | 3-10 |
| 3-7 | LRT White Plains Alignment Option 5 | 3-10 |
| 3-8 | LRT White Plains Alignment Option 12 | 3-10 |
| 4-1 | MTA Metro-North Railroad Map | 4-1 |
| 4-2 | Typical Guideway Segment | 4-3 |
| 4-3 | Alternative 4A-4B-4C Full-Corridor Commuter Rapid Transit in Rockland County | 4-8 |
| 4-4 | Alternative 4A – Full-Corridor Commuter Rapid Transit in Westchester County | 4-9 |


## List of Figures (con't)


| Number | Title | Page |
|---|---|---|
| 4-5 | Alternative 4B – Manhattan-Bound Commuter Rail Transit with Light Rail Transit in Westchester County | 4-12 |
| 4-6 | Alternative 4C – Manhattan-Bound Commuter Rail Transit with Bus Rapid Transit in Westchester County | 4-13 |
| 4-7 | Option 4D – Manhattan-Bound Commuter Rail Transit with Cross Corridor Bus Rapid Transit in Rockland County | 4-14 |
| 4-8 | Option 4D – Manhattan-Bound Commuter Rail Transit with Cross Corridor Bus Rapid Transit in Westchester County | 4-15 |
| 5-1 | BPM Study Area | 5-1 |
| 5-2 | Zone Structure in the Corridor | 5-2 |
| 5-3 | BPM Flow Chart | 5-2 |
| 5-4 | CRT Route Coding | 5-4 |
| 5-5 | Light Rail Route Coding | 5-4 |
| 5-6 | BRT Route Coding | 5-5 |
| 5-7 | Daily Transit Ridership on New Service (Weekday) | 5-8 |
| 5-8 | Commuter Rail Sheds from Orange County (Alternatives 4A, 4B, 4C) | 5-12 |
| 5-9 | Commuter Rail Sheds from Spring Valley (Alternatives 4A, 4B, 4C) | 5-13 |
| 5-10 | Commuter Rail Sheds to Rockefeller Center (East Side) | 5-13 |
| 5-11 | Commuter Rail Sheds to Rockefeller Center (West Side) | 5-14 |
| 5-12 | Commuter Rail Sheds to Empire State Building | 5-14 |
| 7-1 | Capital Cost Estimate | 7-3 |
| 7-2 | Capital Cost Estimate – Transit Split | 7-3 |
| 8-1 | Description of Alternatives/Options | 8-1 |
| 8-2 | Ridership on New Transit Service (2035) | 8-2 |
| 8-3 | Travel Time Savings (AM Peak Period, 2035) | 8-2 |
| 8-4 | Transit Mode Capital Cost Estimate (Year 2012 dollars) | 8-3 |
| 8-5 | Transit Annual Operating Costs and Fare Revenues (2035) | 8-4 |


## List of Tables


| Number | Title | Page |
|---|---|---|
| 1-1 | Work Destinations of Rockland Residents | 1-8 |
| 1-2 | Distribution of Manhattan-Bound Work Journeys of Rockland Residents | 1-9 |
| 1-3 | Major Intra-Rockland Work Journeys Crossing the I-287 Corridor | 1-10 |
| 1-4 | Work Destinations of Westchester Residents | 1-10 |
| 1-5 | Distribution of Manhattan-Bound Work Journeys of Westchester Residents | 1-11 |

## List of Tables (con't)


| Number | Title | Page |
|---|---|---|
| 1-6 | Leading Intra-Westchester Work Journeys within the I-287 Corridor | 1-11 |
| 1-7 | Residential Origins of White Plains Workers | 1-13 |
| 1-8 | Work Destinations of Orange Residents | 1-13 |
| 1-9 | Distribution of Manhattan-Bound Work Journeys of Orange Residents | 1-14 |
| 1-10 | Specific Markets Served by the Tappan Zee Corridor Based on 2000 Journey-to-Work | 1-14 |
| 2-1 | BRT Alignment Options in White Plains – Performance Summary | 2-13 |
| 3-1 | Summary of LRT Options in White Plains | 3-9 |
| 5-1 | Demographic Forecasts by County, 2005 and 2035 | 5-3 |
| 5-2 | Daily Transit Trips for Selected Major Markets (Weekday) | 5-7 |
| 5-3 | Daily Transit Ridership on New Service (Weekday) | 5-9 |
| 5-4 | Transit Accessibility, West of Hudson | 5-9 |
| 5-5 | AM Peak Passenger Miles (Thousands of Miles) | 5-10 |
| 5-6 | AM Peak Travel Time, Selected Trip Pairs (Minutes) | 5-10 |
| 5-7 | AM Peak Travel Time Savings, Selected Trip Pairs (Minutes) | 5-11 |
| 5-8 | AM Peak Transfers, Selected Trip Pairs | 5-11 |
| 5-9 | Distribution of Manhattan Jobs by Best Commuter Rail Station from Orange County, Alternatives 4A, 4B, 4C (2035) | 5-12 |
| 5-10 | Aggregate Travel Time Savings (Hours in the Peak Period [6-10AM]) | 5-15 |
| 5-11 | Transportation Criteria – Capacity (2035) | 5-16 |
| 5-12 | Transportation Criteria – Roadway Congestion (2035) | 5-17 |
| 6-1 | Displacements, Acquisitions, and Easements | 6-2 |
| 6-2 | Wetlands | 6-3 |
| 6-3 | Parklands | 6-4 |
| 6-4 | Historic and Archaeological Resources | 6-6 |
| 6-5 | Hudson River Habitat Disturbance | 6-7 |
| 6-6 | Mesoscale Air Emissions | 6-8 |
| 6-7 | Energy and Greenhouse Gases | 6-9 |
| 7-1 | Vehicle Equipment Capital Costs | 7-2 |
| 7-2 | Cost Per Revenue Vehicle Hour | 7-4 |
| 7-3 | Annual Operating Costs (2012) | 7-5 |
| 7-4 | Fare Revenue | 7-5 |
| 7-5 | Cost/Net Cost Per Passenger Per Passenger-Mile | 7-6 |
| 7-6 | Travel Time Savings | 7-7 |
| 7-7 | Cost Criteria – Project Costs | 7-8 |
| 7-8 | Cost Criteria – Transit Costs | 7-8 |
| 8-1 | Potential Environmental Impacts/Benefits | 8-3 |
| 8-2 | Cost/Net Cost per Passenger and Passenger-Mile | 8-4 |
| 8-2 | Summary Performance Ratings | 8-5 |


## List of Acronyms and Abbreviations

| | |
|---|---|
| 3A | Option 3A (Full-Corridor BRT) – Alternative 3 (full-corridor BRT in high-occupancy toll [HOT] lanes in Rockland) but with an enhanced service plan (including additional stations), extended dedicated bus lanes on Westchester Avenue, and connection to Port Chester Station. Option 3A includes both dedicated bus lanes as well as busways. |
| 3B | Option 3B (Full-Corridor BRT) – combined HOT and BRT lanes in Rockland and a dedicated grade-separated busway across Westchester. |
| 4A | Alternative 4A (Full-Corridor CRT) - as developed to date for the project, with a direct connection to the Hudson Line. |
| 4A-X | Option 4A-X (Full-Corridor CRT) - as developed to date for the project, but without a direct connection to the Hudson Line. A new local Tarrytown Station at the Tappan Zee Bridge is assumed, with a shuttle bus connection to the existing Tarrytown Station. |
| 4B | Alternative 4B (CRT/LRT) - as developed to date for the project, with CRT in Rockland with a direct CRT connection to the Hudson Line and LRT in Westchester. |
| 4C | Alternative 4C (CRT/BRT) - as developed to date for the project, with CRT in Rockland with a direct CRT connection to the Hudson Line and BRT in Westchester. |
| 4D | Option 4D (CRT/BRT) – CRT from Suffern with a direct connection to the Hudson Line and full-corridor BRT as per Option 3A above. However, the Airmont and Tappan Zee CRT Stations of Alternatives 4A, 4B, and 4C are eliminated. |
| AA | Alternatives Analysis |
| ACHP | Advisory Council on Historic Preservation |
| AGT | Automated Guideway Transit |
| APE | Area of Potential Effect |
| APTA | American Public Transportation Association |
| ARC | Access to the Region's Core |
| AVL | Automated Vehicle Locator |
| BPM | Best Practice Model |
| BRT | Bus Rapid Transit |
| BTU | British Thermal Unit |
| CBD | Central Business District |
| CCTV | Closed-Circuit Television |
| CO | Carbon Monoxide |
| $CO_2$ | Carbon Dioxide |
| ConnDOT | Connecticut Department of Transportation |
| CRT | Commuter Rail Transit |
| CSI | Construction Specifications Institute |

## List of Acronyms and Abbreviations (con't)

| | |
|---|---|
| DEIS | Draft Environmental Impact Statement |
| DMU | Diesel Multiple Unit |
| EIS | Environmental Impact Statement |
| EMU | Electric Multiple Unit |
| FHWA | Federal Highway Administration |
| FRA | Federal Rail Administration |
| FTA | Federal Transit Administration |
| GCT | Grand Central Terminal |
| GIS | Geographic Information System |
| GPS | Global Positioning System |
| GSP | Garden State Parkway |
| HAJ | Household Auto-Journey |
| HOT | High-Occupancy Toll |
| HOV | High-Occupancy Vehicle |
| HOV+3 | High-Occupancy Vehicle-3 |
| ITS | Intelligent Transportation System |
| LRT | Light Rail Transit |
| MDSC | Mode Destination Stops Choice |
| MPO | Metropolitan Planning Organization |
| MTA | Metropolitan Transportation Authority |
| µm | micrometer |
| NAAQS | National Ambient Air Quality Standards |
| NEPA | National Environmental Policy Act |
| NHL | National Historic Landmark |
| NHPA | National Historic Preservation Act |
| NJT | New Jersey Transit |
| $NO_x$ | Nitrogen Oxides |
| NOI | Notice of Intent |
| NRE | National Register Eligible |
| NRL | National Register Listed |
| NYC | New York City |
| NYMTC | New York Metropolitan Transportation Council |
| NYSDEC | New York State Department of Environmental Conservation |
| NYSDOT | New York State Department of Transportation |
| NYSHPO | New York State Historic Preservation Office |
| NYSM | New York State Museum |
| NYSTA | New York State Thruway Authority |

## List of Acronyms and Abbreviations (con't)

| | |
|---|---|
| $O_3$ | Ozone |
| PAP | Pre-Assignment Processor |
| Pb | Lead |
| PM | Particulate Matter |
| $PM_{10}$ | Particulate Matter with Diameters up to 10 µm |
| $PM_{2.5}$ | Particulate Matter with Diameters up to 2.5 µm |
| ROD | Record of Decision |
| ROI | Return on Investment |
| ROW | Right of Way |
| RRT | Rail Rapid Transit |
| SAFETEA-LU | Safe, Accountable, Flexible, Efficient Transportation Equity Act: A Legacy for Users |
| SAWG | Stakeholder Advisory Working Group |
| SHPA | State Historic Preservation Act |
| SHPO | State Historic Preservation Office |
| $SO_2$ | Sulfur Dioxide |
| SOV | Single-Occupant Vehicle |
| TDM/TSM | Transportation Demand Management/Transportation Systems Management |
| TIP | Transportation Improvement Program |
| TOD | Transit-Oriented Development |
| TZB | Tappan Zee Bridge |
| USEPA | US Environmental Protection Agency |
| VMT | Vehicle Miles Traveled |
| WPTC | White Plains Transportation Center |

TAPPAN ZEE BRIDGE/I-287
ENVIRONMENTAL REVIEW

# TRANSIT MODE SELECTION REPORT

**PREPARED BY**

**This report was prepared for NYSDOT, MTA/MNR and NYSTA by EarthTech/AECOM.**

David Palmer, P.E., Principal, **Ove Arup & Partners**

**Description of Work Performed by Firm:**
Provided cost estimates and engineering work to support the development of the transit alternatives and options.

PLACE P.E. STAMP

PLACE P.E. STAMP

Nicholas Spaventa, P.E., Principal, **EarthTech/AECOM**

**Description of Work Performed by Firm:**
Prepared Transit Mode Selection Report, including development of alternatives/options, and conducted all supporting transportation and environmental analyses, including BPM transportation demand modeling.

RECOMMENDED FOR ACCEPTANCE BY:

Glen Kartalis, P.E., Principal, **DMJM Harris**

***Note:*** *It is a violation of law for any person, unless they are acting under the direction of a licensed professional engineer, architect, landscape architect, or land surveyor, to alter an item in any way. If an item bearing the stamp of a licensed professional is altered, the altering engineer, architect, landscape architect, or land surveyor shall stamp the document and include the notation "altered by" followed by their signature, the date of such alteration, and a specific description of the alteration.*

Thruway Authority

NEW YORK STATE DEPARTMENT OF TRANSPORTATION

Metro-North Railroad

BRT

LRT

CRT